Designing Argument Lessons

Kate McNeill
Boston College
Maria Gonzalez-Howard
Boston College

Overview of Class

Date	Topic
Nov. 27 2:30 – 3:45	Introduction to Argumentation
Dec. 4 2:30 – 3:45	Designing Argument Lessons
Dec. 6 (Thursday) 12:30 – 3:30	Student conceptions Designing supports
Dec. 11 2:30 – 3:45	Classroom talk
Feb. 12 2:30 – 3:45	Assessments and rubrics

Overview of Today

- Define Claim, Evidence and Reasoning
- Presentation on designing argument lessons
- Analyze CER questions – Characteristics of a "good" question
- Discuss Thursday (Class #3)

How do we define claim, evidence and reasoning?

- With your colleagues:
  - Develop definitions for claim, evidence and reasoning that would work across history and science.
  - Consider any distinctions for the 3 components you would want to help students make between the disciplines.
- Use resources to develop definition
  - Nussbaum article and McNeill & Krajcik chapters
  - ELA common core
  - Ideas from last class

Definition of Claim

- A conclusion being drawn from the interpretation of facts
- Role of the claim: a statement around which the argument is organized
- A position that you take on an issue (such as in a debate)
- An answer to a question or a problem
  - More "kid" friendly
- A statement that answers or draws a conclusion to a question (allows opinion and fact)
- A thesis statement
- A complete statement that answers the question and will be supported by data

Definition of Evidence

- Supporting details
- Supporting data
- Independent vs. dependent evidence
- Comes from a source that's not "you"
  - Can be observed in the same way by anybody
  - Constant observable feature
- Information that supports the claim
  - Science: quantitative and qualitative data
  - Social Studies: quantitative and qualitative data, primary source material, prior knowledge, experience

Definition of Reasoning

- An explanation of how the evidence supports the claim
- It offers a way to interpret the evidence
- The relationship between the claim and the evidence
  - Helps students with looking at descriptions (example: pharaoh)
- The reasoning also persuades the reader that the evidence supports the claim
- In science the reasoning is the scientific principle that explains the evidence
  - This knowledge varies amongst the grade levels
- Allows students to demonstrate the inferential piece
  - Show the "why"

Designing Argument Lessons

- Step 1: Identify the question and data
- Step 2: Imagine the ideal student response
- Step 3: Create classroom supports

Step 1: Identify Question and Data

- What question will you ask students?
- Criteria for a "good" question:
  - *Is the question clear in terms of what claim(s) a student should provide?*
  - *Is there data the students could use as evidence?*
  - *Is there reasoning students could use to explain why their evidence supports their claim?*

Step 1: Identify Question and Data

- What specific data will you either provide students or have students collect?
- Characteristics of data:
  - *Complexity and type of data*
  - *Amount of data*

Step 2: Imagine the ideal student response

- Draft an "ideal" student response
  - Does the claim align with the original question?
  - Does there seem to be appropriate and sufficient evidence to use to support the claim?
  - Does the question and context provide opportunities for students to include appropriate reasoning?
  - How complex is the response? What type of additional support might students need?

Step 3: Create classroom supports

- Visual representations
  - E.g. poster
- Curricular scaffolds
  - E.g. sentence starters, prompts, etc.
- Activity structures
  - E.g. Specific ways to structure instruction such as time to work in pairs/groups before writing individually or engaging in a full class debate

Designing Argument Lessons

- Step 1: Identify the question and data
- Step 2: Imagine the ideal student response
- Step 3: Create classroom supports

Analyze CER Questions

- With a partner(s) analyze the four sample CER questions
- Rate each (poor, good, excellent) using the following three criteria:
  - *Is the question clear in terms of what claim(s) a student should provide?*
  - *Is there data the students could use as evidence?*
  - *Is there reasoning students could use to explain why their evidence supports their claim?*
- Suggestions for revisions
  - Include any suggestions for revision.

Conclusion and Discussion

- Working on defining similarities and differences around claim, evidence and reasoning in history and science.
- Designing Argument Lessons
  - Step 1: Identify the question and data
  - Step 2: Imagine the ideal student response
  - Step 3: Create classroom supports
- Next Time:
  - History example, common student difficulties, creating classroom supports

Thursday – Class 3. Dec. 6

- Assignment #1 – Due Thursday, Dec. 6
  - Conduct a lesson (or assign homework) that includes argumentation. Collect 6 samples of student writing to share with your colleagues (2 stronger, 2 middle, 2 weaker).
  - Write reflection about your lesson
- In class
  - You will have work time with your colleague. Bring any resources you may want to use

Contact Information

- http://argument-history-science.weebly.com
- Kate McNeill
  - kmcneill@bc.edu
- Maria Gonzalez-Howard
  - Maria.gonzalez.7@bc.edu